

Minutes

Planning Committee Tuesday, 27th June, 2023

Attendance

Cllr Mynott (Chair)	Cllr Gelderbloem
Cllr M Cuthbert (Vice-Chair)	Cllr Gorton
Cllr Dr Barrett	Cllr Heard
Cllr Bridge	Cllr McCheyne
Cllr Mrs N Cuthbert	Cllr Munden
Cllr Mrs Francois	Cllr Mrs Murphy

Apologies

Substitute Present

Also Present

Cllr Sankey
Cllr Mrs Davies
Cllr Dicker
Cllr North
Cllr Parker
Cllr Poppy

Officers Present

Phil Drane	- Director - Place
Caroline Corrigan	- Corporate Manager (Planning Development Management)
Julia Sargeant	- Senior Planning Officer
Georgia Taylor	- Planning Assistant
Zoe Borman	- Governance and Member Support Officer

57. Apologies for Absence

No apologies had been received.

58. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The Minutes of the last meeting held on Wednesday 22nd March 2023 were agreed as a true record.

The Chair proposed to vary the order of the agenda and hear Item 8, Ingatestone Railway Station, as the first application. This was agreed by Members.

59. INGATESTONE RAILWAY STATION, STATION LANE, INGATESTONE, ESSEX, CM4 0BW; APPLICATION NO: 23/00197/LBC

The application had been made by local member Cllr Sankey. Therefore, the item had been referred to Planning Committee in accordance with the provisions of Part 5.2, Part B – Planning Committee Procedures, 2.1(c) (pg.204 of the Constitution).

Listed Building Consent is sought for the “*construction of a blue plaque to the rear of the station building on the London bound platform*” at Ingatestone Railway Station.

Ms Julia Sargeant presented the report.

Cllr Sankey addressed the committee as the applicant who referred the matter.

Cllr Gorton spoke as Ward Councillor in support of the application and **MOVED** that the application be **APPROVED**. This was **SECONDED** by Cllr Mynott.

Following discussion Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Dr Barrett; Bridge, M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Francois, Gelderbloem, Gorton, Heard, McCheyne, Munden, Murphy, Mynott (12)

AGAINST: (0)

ABSTAIN: (0)

The application was **APPROVED** subject to conditions outlined in the report.

60. CLAY HALL DAYS LANE PILGRIMS HATCH BRENTWOOD ESSEX CM15 9SJ; APPLICATION NO: 23/00207/FUL

This application had been referred to the Committee by Councillor Vicky Davies for the following reasons: condition 4 is very restrictive in that it doesn't allow any extensions or any alterations to the external appearance of the host dwelling. The condition is considered unreasonable and fails the test of a condition as set out in the framework and guidance.

Ms Julia Sargeant presented the report.

The applicant, Mr Jason Joplin, addressed the Committee in support of the application.

Cllr Davies, Ward Councillor, also spoke in favour of the application.

Members were sympathetic to the application, however, feared that should Condition 4 be removed, control of any future development via the planning process would be lost.

Cllr Mynott **MOVED** that the application be **REFUSED**. This was **SECONDED** by Cllr M Cuthbert.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Dr Barrett, Bridge, M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Gelderbloem, Gorton, Heard, Munden, Murphy, Mynott (10)

AGAINST: Cllrs Francois, McCheyne (2)

ABSTAIN: (0)

The application was **REFUSED**.

61. PROPOSED 5G TELECOMS INSTALLATION: H3G 15M STREET POLE AND ADDITIONAL EQUIPMENT CABINETS APPLICATION NO: 23/00531/PNTEL

This application had been reported to the Planning and Licensing committee in accordance with the requirements of the Council's Constitution.

Miss Georgia Taylor presented the report.

Attempts had been made to contact the applicant, however, these were unsuccessful.

The Committee was mindful that 5G Telecom masts were needed within the borough, however, more suitable locations were required to be found. Members hoped for engagement between officers and the applicant to reach a speedy solution.

Cllr Bridge **MOVED** and Cllr Dr Barrett **SECONDED** that the application be **REFUSED**.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Dr Barrett, Bridge, M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Francois, Gelderbloem, Gorton, Heard, Munden, Murphy, Mynott (11)

AGAINST: Cllr McCheyne (1)

ABSTAIN: (0)

The application was **REFUSED**.

62. 151 INGRAVE ROAD BRENTWOOD ESSEX CM13 2AA; APPLICATION NO: 23/00308/FUL

This application had been referred to Committee at the request of Cllr Tim Barrett for the following reason:

I believe this application should be discussed, considered and debated by the Planning Committee as the proposed changes would create a property similar to those in the immediate surroundings. I believe in this case we may be considering the change to the current building more than the resulting property after completion and its relation to the local landscape of properties.

Miss Georgia Taylor presented the report.

Following discussion Cllr Mynott **MOVED** for the application to be **REFUSED**. This was **SECONDED** by Cllr Murphy.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Bridge, M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Francois, Gelderbloem, Gorton, Heard, McCheyne, Munden, Murphy, Mynott (11)

AGAINST: (0)

ABSTAIN: (0)

The application was **REFUSED**.

[Cllr Dr Barrett declared a non-pecuniary interest and did not vote.]

63. COPPICE BUNGALOW SCHOOL ROAD KELVEDON HATCH BRENTWOOD ESSEX CM15 0DL; APPLICATION NO: 22/01008/FUL

This application has been referred to Planning Committee by Kelvedon Hatch Parish Council on the following basis:

Our Council objected to this proposal most strongly on the grounds of over development, inadequate parking for three, four bedroom houses and the closeness to the adjacent SSSI. The footings of the houses will probably damage the trees in this protected site. This was supported by other bodies who look after these SSSIs.

Ms Julia Sargeant presented the report.

The Agent, Mr Ben Willis, spoke in support of the application.

Cllr Richard North from Kelvedon Parish Council addressed the Committee raising concerns such as viability of sustainability and ecology reports, overbearing and not in keeping with the surrounding area, limited public transport, parking and proximity to the SSSI.

Cllr Parker and Cllr Poppy Ward Councillors, spoke in support of the application and could see no planning reasons for refusal.

Cllr Bridge **MOVED** and Cllr McCheyne **SECONDED** that the application be **APPROVED**.

Cllr Mynott gave his reasons why he could not support the application and sited the difference in character of the proposed development to that in School Road; in his opinion, policy BE14 was not met, NE07 Part B also raised concerns as well as proximity of the SSSI.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs Bridge, Francois, Heard, McCheyne, Murphy (5)

AGAINST: Cllrs M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Gelderbloem, Munden, Mynott (5)

ABSTAIN: Cllr Dr Barrett (1)

The Chair had the casting vote and the motion to **APPROVE** the application was **LOST**.

Cllr Mynott **MOVED** that the application be **REFUSED**. This was **SECONDED** by Cllr M Cuthbert.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllrs M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Gelderbloem, Munden, Mynott (5)

AGAINST: Cllrs Bridge, Francois, Heard, McCheyne, Murphy (5)

ABSTAIN: Cllr Dr Barrett (1)

The Chair had the casting vote. The application was **REFUSED**.

[Cllr Gorton declared a non-pecuniary interest and did not vote.]

64. LAND TO THE SOUTH OF BASKEVYNS DAYS LANE DODDINGHURST ESSEX; APPLICATION NO: 22/01734/FUL

This application had been referred to Planning Committee at the request of Doddinghurst Parish Council, objecting to the development on the following basis:

- Buildings proposed are excessive for the use as shelters for alpacas and goats.
- The field is known to be wet, which is not conducive to keeping alpacas and goats.
- Animal welfare is a concern as there is no mention of a fresh water supply and the applicant lives some considerable distance from the site.
- This part of Days Lane is a Protected Lane according to BBC's published Local Plan 2016-2033 Policy Map 4. Although we appreciated that this is not a reason in itself for refusal, Clause 5.172 states that an assessment of material increases in motorised traffic will be required.
- The site lies within the Green Belt and the applicant has demonstrated no special circumstances which would outweigh harm.

Ms Julia Sargeant presented the report.

The Committee heard from an objector, Ms Smith.

The Applicant, Mr Senior, spoke supporting his application.

Cllr Dicker, Doddinghurst Parish Council, addressed the Committee, opposing to the application for reasons of excessive buildings for use; welfare of the animals; protected lane and green belt.

Cllr Parker, Ward Councillor, stated he could see no planning reasons for refusal.

Cllr Gelderbloem also spoke as Ward Councillor, raising concerns regarding animal welfare and the use of the buildings.

Officers confirmed that the buildings were for agricultural use only and Alpacas were classed as livestock.

Following discussion Cllr Dr Barrett **MOVED** and Cllr Mynott **SECONDED** that the application be **APPROVED**.

Members voted as follows:

FOR: Cllr Dr Barrett, Bridge, M Cuthbert, N Cuthbert, Francois, Gelderbloem, Heard, Munden, Murphy, Mynott (10)

AGAINST: (0)

ABSTAIN: Cllr Gorton (1)

The application was **APPROVED**.

[Cllr McCheyne declared a non-pecuniary interest and did not vote].

65. Urgent Business

There were no items of urgent business.

The meeting concluded at 21:05